

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<i>Acknowledgments</i> . . . . .	xiii
<i>Preface</i> . . . . .	xv
<i>Foreword: Filartiga's Way</i> . . . . .	xvii
<i>About the Author</i> . . . . .	xxi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> . . . . .	xxiii
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
<b>Chapter 2: <i>Filartiga v. Pena-Irala</i>: The Birth of Transnational Litigation</b> . . . . .	17
A. Death in Paraguay . . . . .	17
B. Justice in America . . . . .	28
<b>Chapter 3: <i>Filartiga</i> and the Development of Transnational Litigation</b> . . . . .	77
A. Extending <i>Filartiga</i> Through Legislation . . . . .	78
1. Torture Victim Protection Act . . . . .	78
2. Anti-Terrorism Act . . . . .	83
3. Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act . . . . .	86
B. Extending <i>Filartiga</i> Through Litigation . . . . .	91
1. Argentina: <i>Forti v. Suarez-Mason</i> . . . . .	91
2. Burma: <i>Doe v. Unocal</i> . . . . .	98
3. Chile: <i>Cabello v. Fernandez-Larios</i> . . . . .	108
4. Ethiopia: <i>Abebe-Jira v. Negewo</i> . . . . .	114
5. The Philippines: <i>In re Marcos Human Rights Litigation</i> . . . . .	119
6. Former Yugoslavia: <i>Kadic v. Karadzic</i> . . . . .	125
C. Holocaust Litigation . . . . .	136
D. <i>Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain</i> : The Supreme Court Speaks . . . . .	143
<b>Chapter 4: Conclusion</b> . . . . .	159
<b>Appendix: Litigation Documents and Related Materials</b> . . . . .	185
March 30, 1976: Paraguay	
Police Summary of Crime Scene . . . . .	187
October 21, 1976: Paraguay	
Memorandum from American Embassy, Asunción to File	
Subject: <i>Filartiga</i> Case—	
Visit by Dr. Horacio Galeano Perrone . . . . .	189

February 15, 1977: United States Telegram from U.S. Department of State to American Embassy, Asunción .....	191
February 18, 1977: Paraguay Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Filartiga Case. ....	193
March 29, 1977: Paraguay Correspondence from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State .....	197
April 6, 1977: United States Correspondence from U.S. Department of State to American Embassy, Asunción. ....	199
April 21, 1977: United States Memorandum from U.S. Department of State to Files Subject: Filartiga and Related Matters. ....	201
May 10, 1977: Paraguay Memorandum from American Embassy, Asunción Subject: The Filartiga Case. ....	203
January 23, 1978: Paraguay Memorandum from American Embassy, Asunción Subject: Filartiga Case. ....	205
April 5, 1979: United States Telegram from U.S. Department of State to American Embassy, Asunción Subject: NIV Case .....	211
April 6, 1979: United States Correspondence from Congressman Robert F. Drinan to Barbara Watson, Assistant Secretary of State .....	213
April 6, 1979: United States Civil Complaint Filed in U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York; Exhibits; Affidavit of Richard Arens .....	215
April 6, 1979: United States Telegram from U.S. Department of State to American Embassy, Asunción .....	231
April 6, 1979: United States Telegram from U.S. Department of State to American Embassy, Asunción Subject: NIV Case .....	233

April 7, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State	
Subject: Americo Peña Case . . . . .	235
April 7, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State . . . . .	239
April 9, 1979: United States	
Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in	
Support of Order to Show Cause for Stay of Deportation	
and for Order Permitting Depositions of the Prisoners;	
Affidavit of Dolly Filártiga. . . . .	241
April 9, 1979: United States	
U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York:	
Order to Show Cause and to Stay Deportation. . . . .	253
April 10, 1979: Paraguay	
Criminal Investigation Report . . . . .	255
April 10, 1979: United States	
Plaintiffs' Petition for Writ of Habeas Corpus	
Testificandum . . . . .	257
April 12, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State	
Subject: Filartiga Case Press Reaction . . . . .	261
April 12, 1979: United States	
Deposition of Americo Peña-Irala . . . . .	263
April 13, 1979: United States	
Brief Amicus Curiae in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion to	
Restrain Defendant Immigration and Naturalization	
Service from Enforcing Defendant Pena-Irala's Departure	
from the United States . . . . .	267
April 14, 1979: United States	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State	
Subject: NIV Case; Legal Status . . . . .	271
April 14, 1979: United States	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State	
Subject: NIV Case . . . . .	275

April 16, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Filartiga Case Press Reaction . . . . .	277
April 20, 1979: Paraguay	
Memorandum from American Embassy, Asunción to Files Subject: Statement by Mother of the Accused Murderer of Dr. Filartiga's Son . . . . .	279
April 23, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Press Reaction to Pena/Filartiga Case . . . . .	283
April 25, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Meeting with President Stroessner . . . . .	287
April 26, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Defense Counsel Robert Rebollo to U.S. District Court Judge Nickerson . . . . .	289
May 3, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Filartiga Case. . . . .	294
May 7, 1979: United States	
Defendant Pena-Irala's Notice Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion to Dismiss Complaint and Vacate Stay . . . . .	296
May 8, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Pena/Filartiga Case . . . . .	316
May 9, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from United States Attorney Edward R. Korman to U.S. District Court Judge Nickerson . . . . .	319
May 11, 1979: United States	
Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendant Peña-Irala's Motion to Dismiss Complaint and Vacate Stay; Affidavits of Myres MacDougal, Richard Lillich, Thomas Franck, and Richard Falk. . . . .	323
May 14, 1979: United States	
Plaintiffs' Opposition to Point II of Defendant's Memorandum Urging Vacatur of the Stay of Deportation. . . . .	343

May 15, 1979: United States U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Memorandum and Order. . . . .	349
May 15, 1979: United States Plaintiffs' Notice of Appeal . . . . .	353
May 16, 1979: United States Plaintiffs' Notice of Motion and Motion for Interim Relief Pending Appeal. . . . .	355
May 18, 1979: United States U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Judgment. . . . .	367
May 18, 1979: United States Federal Appellees Affirmation in Opposition to Motion for Interim Relief Pending Appeal . . . . .	369
May 18, 1979: United States Correspondence from Defense Counsel Murry Brochin to Second Circuit Court of Appeals. . . . .	373
May 22, 1979: United States Second Circuit Court of Appeals: Order. . . . .	377
May 23, 1979: United States Application to United States Supreme Court for a Stay of Deportation to Permit Taking Immediate Depositions Pending Appeal. . . . .	379
May 24, 1979: United States United States Supreme Court: Order . . . . .	393
July 3, 1979: United States Brief of Amici Curiae (Amnesty International USA, International League for Human Rights, and Lawyers Committee for International Human Rights) on Behalf of Appellants . . . . .	395
July 23, 1979: United States Appellants' Brief . . . . .	411
July 23, 1979: United States Brief of Amici Curiae (International Human Rights Law Group, Council on Hemispheric Affairs, and Washington Office on Latin America) on Behalf of Appellants . . . . .	451
August 7, 1979: United States Correspondence from U.S. Attorney to Second Circuit Court of Appeals . . . . .	479

August 9, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Deputy Legal Adviser, U.S.	
Department of State to Department of Justice . . . . .	481
August 27, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Deputy Legal Adviser, U.S.	
Department of State to Department of Justice . . . . .	483
August 29, 1979: United States	
Memorandum from Justice Department, Civil Rights	
Division to the Solicitor General . . . . .	485
September 14, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Deputy Legal Adviser, U.S.	
Department of State to Department of Justice . . . . .	509
September 14, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Deputy Legal Adviser, U.S.	
Department of State to U.S. Solicitor General . . . . .	511
September 18, 1979: United States	
Appellee's Brief . . . . .	515
September 28, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from Members of Congress to the	
U.S. Solicitor General . . . . .	537
October 3, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from U.S. Solicitor General to	
Members of Congress . . . . .	539
October 9, 1979: United States	
Appellants' Reply Brief . . . . .	541
October 29, 1979: United States	
Correspondence from the Clerk of the Second	
Circuit Court of Appeals to Office of the Legal Advisor,	
U.S. Department of State . . . . .	557
November 23, 1979: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S.	
Department of State	
Subject: Foreign Minister Nogues on Filártiga Case . . . . .	559
May 29, 1980: United States	
Memorandum for United States as Amicus Curiae . . . . .	563
June 30, 1980: United States	
Second Circuit Court of Appeals: Decision . . . . .	581
September 3, 1980: United States	
Correspondence from Defense Counsel Murry Brochin	
to U.S. District Court Judge Nickerson . . . . .	601

September 3, 1980: United States	
Affidavit of Murry D. Brochin in Support of Motion to Withdraw as Attorney . . . . .	603
April 8, 1981: United States	
Revised Notice of Plaintiffs' Application for Default Judgment . . . . .	607
June 23, 1981: United States	
U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Order Entering Default Judgment. . . . .	611
February 12, 1982: United States	
Transcript of Hearing on Damages Before the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York . . . . .	613
February 25, 1982: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: The Filartiga Case in the News . . . . .	651
March 10, 1982: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: The Filartiga Case . . . . .	653
December 10, 1982: United States	
Plaintiffs' Post-Trial Memorandum of Facts and Law; Affidavits of Dolly Filartiga, Joel Filartiga, and Dr. Glenn Randall and Dr. Jose Quiroga. . . . .	655
December 15, 1982: Paraguay	
Paraguayan Investigation File. . . . .	725
May 13, 1983: United States	
U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Magistrate's Report and Recommendation. . . . .	727
May 20, 1983: United States	
U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Addendum to Magistrate's Report and Recommendation . . . .	737
July 12, 1983: United States	
Plaintiffs' Objections to Magistrate's Report. . . . .	739
January 10, 1984: United States	
U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Memorandum and Order. . . . .	745
January 31, 1984: Paraguay	
Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Human Rights—Case of Dr. Joel Filartiga . . . . .	755

February 2, 1984: United States U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York: Judgment . . . . .	757
September 20, 1984: Paraguay Telegram from American Embassy, Asunción to U.S. Department of State Subject: Paraguay Restores Human Rights Activist's Passport . . . . .	759
January 29, 2004: United States Civil Complaint Filed in U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York. . . . .	761
<i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .	763
<i>Index</i> . . . . .	787